



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**

Bay Area Metro Center
375 Beale Street, Suite 800
San Francisco, CA 94105
415.778.6700
www.mtc.ca.gov

Air Quality Conformity Task Force

Metropolitan Transportation Commission

Bay Area Metro Center

Mount Hamilton Conference Room

375 Beale Street, Suite 800

(Note: Visitors must check in with the receptionist on the 7th floor)

San Francisco, CA

Conference Call Number: Dial - **(415) 655-0002 (Access Code: 920 668 927)**

Participant ID is # **button**.

Thursday, August 23, 2018

9:30 a.m. –11:00 a.m.

AGENDA

1. Welcome and Introductions
2. Consent Calendar
 - a. July 26, 2018 Air Quality Conformity Task Force Meeting Summary
3. Other Items – Information
 - a. Quick Reference Guide: Generating Traffic & Activity Data for Project-Level Air Quality Analyses
See: [http://onlinepubs.trb.org/onlinepubs/nchrp/docs/NCHRP25-25\(96\)_QRG.pdf](http://onlinepubs.trb.org/onlinepubs/nchrp/docs/NCHRP25-25(96)_QRG.pdf)

Next Meeting: September 27, 2018

MTC Staff Liaison: Harold Brazil hbrazil@mtc.ca.gov

**Air Quality Conformity Task Force
Summary Meeting Notes
July 26, 2018**

Participants:

Ginger Vagenas – EPA

Dick Fahey – Caltrans

Lucas Sanchez – Caltrans

Richard Shinn – Iteris, Inc.

Sara Muse – C/CAG

John Hoang – C/CAG

Ken Born – FHWA

Shalanda Christian – Caltrans

Andrea Gordon – BAAQMD

Dominique Kraft – FTA

Adam Crenshaw – MTC

Harold Brazil – MTC

1. Welcome and Self Introductions: Harold Brazil (MTC) called the meeting to order at 9:35 am.

2. PM_{2.5} Project Conformity Interagency Consultations

a. Consultation to Determine Project of Air Quality Concern Status

i. ITS Improvements in San Mateo County Northern Cities Project

John Hoang (City County Association of Governments - C/CAG) began the ITS Improvements in San Mateo County Northern Cities project presentation by identifying the goals and objectives for the twenty cities and the county of San Mateo:

- Enable cross jurisdictional traffic coordination between local cities and Caltrans
- Enable inter-jurisdictional cooperation and interface
- Provide technology for enhanced traffic congestion and management
- Install infrastructure to enable management of transportation infrastructure
- Efficient traffic management
- Improve travel time reliability
- Improve response time for incident management
- Implement infrastructure for future applications

Mr. Hoang noted that the ITS Improvements project is an incident management project that deploys incident management (ITS) which enables communication between Caltrans and the cities and county of San Mateo. Mr. Hoang also listed the ITS Improvements project's technology program benefits:

- Inter-jurisdictional cooperation between cities and Caltrans
- Manage day-to-day traffic congestion on major arterials
- Manage non-recurring traffic during major freeway incidents
- Shared control and operation improving cross jurisdictional traffic management
- Manage arterial traffic during major incidents on freeway

Mr. Hoang stated that Caltrans maintains an operating agreement with each participant city to operate traffic signals (on Caltrans' and San Mateo County cities' right-of-way) from Caltrans'

traffic control center in Oakland. Mr. Hoang also mentioned the ITS Improvements project's scope of work:

- 6 directional signs (trailblazer) to guide traffic through the local network
- 61 fixed closed-circuit television cameras to monitor traffic congestion at end-of-queue locations
- 4 arterial dynamic message signs (proposed at Airport Blvd., Oyster Pt. Blvd., Gateway Blvd., and South Airport Blvd.) to provide additional information to motorists
- 20 traffic signal controllers
- 7 microwave vehicle detection systems
- Fiber optic cables

Andrea Gordon (BAAQMD) asked if the ITS Improvements project will include roads and freeway near SFO and Mr. Hoang indicated that SFO is the City of San Francisco's jurisdiction, but San Bruno Ave. (near SFO) there is signage which is part of traffic coordination with Caltrans.

Dick Fahey (Caltrans) asked two questions; 1. How frequently will the signal system be activated? Mr. Hoang responded by indicating (historically) approximately 1 (one) incident every couple years – adding that C/CAG doesn't anticipate too many incidents in need of traffic management, but there are enough impacts when there are incidents to drive the need for the project. And question 2. What was the source of the truck percentage data? Richard Shinn (Iteris, Inc.) responded by indicating that the source was Caltrans' 2015 Annual Average Truck Data.

Final Determination: With input from FTA, EPA, Caltrans and FHWA (deferring their determination to Caltrans), the Task Force concluded that the ITS Improvements in San Mateo County Northern Cities project was not of air quality concern.

Please Note: Ken Born (FHWA) unintentionally also made a not a project of air quality concern determination, but (via email) Joseph Vaughn (FHWA) stated FHWA would be deferring their determination to Caltrans on the ITS Improvements in San Mateo County Northern Cities project. Lucas Sanchez (Caltrans) was forwarded the deference email from Mr. Vaughn.

b. Confirm Projects Are Exempt from PM_{2.5} Conformity

i. Projects Exempt Under 40 CFR 93.126 – Not of Air Quality Concern

Final Determination: With input from FTA, EPA, Caltrans and FHWA, the Task Force agreed the projects on the exempt list (**2b_Exempt List 071218.pdf**) was exempt from PM_{2.5} project level analysis.

3. Consent Calendar

a. June 28, 2018 Air Quality Conformity Task Force Meeting Summary

With input from all members, the Task Force concluded that the consent calendar was approved.

4. Other Items – Updates

a. Downtown Novato SMART Station (Offline Task Force Concurrence)

Please see the following email-chain documenting the Task Force's determination concurrence that the Downtown Novato SMART station is not a regionally significant project for air quality conformity purposes:

From: Fahey, Dick@DOT
To: [Sanchez, Lucas@DOT](mailto:Sanchez.Lucas@DOT); [Vagenas, Ginger](mailto:Vagenas.Ginger); [Adam Crenshaw](mailto:Adam.Crenshaw); [Kraft, Dominique](mailto:Kraft.Dominique); [Born, Kenneth \(FHWA\)](mailto:Born.Kenneth(FHWA)); agordon@baaqmd.gov; [OConnor, Karina](mailto:OConnor.Karina); [Mortenson, Marilee C@DOT](mailto:Mortenson.Marilee.C@DOT); [Tavitas, Rodney A@DOT](mailto:Tavitas.Rodney.A@DOT); [Young, Jelani@DOT](mailto:Young.Jelani@DOT)
Cc: [Harold Brazil](mailto:Harold.Brazil); [Ross McKeown](mailto:Ross.McKeown)
Subject: RE: Urgent request for consultation on the Downtown Novato SMART station
Date: Monday, July 23, 2018 1:08:45 PM

Sorry for the late response. I concur with the determination that this project is not regionally significant for air quality conformity purposes.

Thanks,

-df

Richard Fahey, GISP, AICP | Senior Transportation Planner
[Caltrans - District 4](#) | Office of System and Regional Planning
111 Grand Avenue, Oakland, CA 94612 | (510) 286-5761

From: Sanchez, Lucas@DOT
Sent: Monday, July 23, 2018 7:06 AM
To: Vagenas, Ginger <Vagenas.Ginger@epa.gov>; Adam Crenshaw <ACrenshaw@bayareametro.gov>; Kraft, Dominique <Dominique.Kraft@dot.gov>; Born, Kenneth (FHWA) <kenneth.born@dot.gov>; agordon@baaqmd.gov; [OConnor, Karina](mailto:OConnor.Karina@epa.gov) <OConnor.Karina@epa.gov>; [Mortenson, Marilee C@DOT](mailto:Mortenson.Marilee.C@DOT) <marilee.mortenson@dot.ca.gov>; [Tavitas, Rodney A@DOT](mailto:Tavitas.Rodney.A@DOT) <rodney.tavitas@dot.ca.gov>; [Young, Jelani@DOT](mailto:Young.Jelani@DOT) <Jelani.Young@dot.ca.gov>; [Fahey, Dick@DOT](mailto:Fahey.Dick@DOT) <dick.fahey@dot.ca.gov>; [Fahey, Dick@DOT](mailto:Fahey.Dick@DOT) <dick.fahey@dot.ca.gov>
Cc: [Harold Brazil](mailto:Harold.Brazil) <HBrazil@bayareametro.gov>; [Ross McKeown](mailto:Ross.McKeown) <RMcKeown@bayareametro.gov>
Subject: RE: Urgent request for consultation on the Downtown Novato SMART station

All,

After discussing with Rodney, we agree with the determination that this is not a regionally significant project for air quality conformity purposes.

Thank you,

Lucas Sanchez
Environmental Planner
AQEH Branch of Regional Planning
Division of Transportation Planning
California Department of Transportation, HQ
Office: 916-653-2023 | Fax: 916-653-1447
lucas.sanchez@dot.ca.gov

How did we do? Help us serve you better! Caltrans Division of Transportation Planning
Customer Service Survey Link:

<https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/CTDOTP>

From: Vagenas, Ginger [<mailto:Vagenas.Ginger@epa.gov>]
Sent: Friday, July 20, 2018 4:14 PM
To: Adam Crenshaw <ACrenshaw@bayareametro.gov>; Kraft, Dominique <Dominique.Kraft@dot.gov>; Born, Kenneth (FHWA) <kenneth.born@dot.gov>; agordon@baaqmd.gov; OConnor, Karina <OConnor.Karina@epa.gov>; Mortenson, Marilee C@DOT <marilee.mortenson@dot.ca.gov>; Tavitias, Rodney A@DOT <rodney.tavitias@dot.ca.gov>; Sanchez, Lucas@DOT <Lucas.Sanchez@dot.ca.gov>; Young, Jelani@DOT <Jelani.Young@dot.ca.gov>; Fahey, Dick@DOT <dick.fahey@dot.ca.gov>; Fahey, Dick@DOT <dick.fahey@dot.ca.gov>
Cc: Harold Brazil <HBrazil@bayareametro.gov>; Ross McKeown <RMcKeown@bayareametro.gov>
Subject: RE: Urgent request for consultation on the Downtown Novato SMART station

Hi all –

Karina and I have talked and we agree with the determination that this is not a regionally significant project. That said, it would be good to hear what Caltrans thinks.

Ginger

From: Adam Crenshaw [<mailto:ACrenshaw@bayareametro.gov>]
Sent: Thursday, July 19, 2018 5:16 PM
To: Kraft, Dominique <Dominique.Kraft@dot.gov>; Born, Kenneth (FHWA) <kenneth.born@dot.gov>; agordon@baaqmd.gov; OConnor, Karina <OConnor.Karina@epa.gov>; Vagenas, Ginger <Vagenas.Ginger@epa.gov>; marilee.mortenson@dot.ca.gov; rodney.tavitias@dot.ca.gov; Lucas.Sanchez@dot.ca.gov; Jelani.Young@dot.ca.gov; dick.fahey@dot.ca.gov; dick_fahey@dot.ca.gov
Cc: Harold Brazil <HBrazil@bayareametro.gov>; Ross McKeown <RMcKeown@bayareametro.gov>
Subject: RE: Urgent request for consultation on the Downtown Novato SMART station

Good afternoon,

Thank you very much for the feedback on this project. I apologize again for the short notice.

Adam

From: Kraft, Dominique [<mailto:Dominique.Kraft@dot.gov>]
Sent: Thursday, July 19, 2018 4:14 PM
To: Born, Kenneth (FHWA) <kenneth.born@dot.gov>; Andrea Gordon <AGordon@baaqmd.gov>; Adam Crenshaw <ACrenshaw@bayareametro.gov>; OConnor.Karina@epa.gov; Vagenas.ginger@EPA.gov; marilee.mortenson@dot.ca.gov; rodney.tavitias@dot.ca.gov; Lucas.Sanchez@dot.ca.gov; Jelani.Young@dot.ca.gov; dick.fahey@dot.ca.gov; dick_fahey@dot.ca.gov
Cc: Harold Brazil <HBrazil@bayareametro.gov>; Ross McKeown <RMcKeown@bayareametro.gov>

Subject: RE: Urgent request for consultation on the Downtown Novato SMART station

All,

I am writing to provide FTA's concurrence that the project is not regionally significant for air quality conformity purposes.

As information, FTA approved a Finding of No Significant Impact (FONSI) for the SMART Rail project (for the project wide Environmental Assessment, or EA). The EA includes the ridership projections outlined in the email below and therefore we do not have concerns to share on this project.

Thanks.

Dominique M. Kraft

Federal Transit Administration, Region IX
90 Seventh Street, Suite 15-300
San Francisco, CA 94103-6701
Phone Number: 415-734-9469
Email: dominique.kraft@dot.gov

From: Born, Kenneth (FHWA)

Sent: Thursday, July 19, 2018 3:28 PM

To: Kraft, Dominique <Dominique.Kraft@dot.gov>; Andrea Gordon <AGordon@baaqmd.gov>; Adam Crenshaw <ACrenshaw@bayareametro.gov>; OConnor.Karina@epa.gov; Vagenas.ginger@EPA.gov; marilee.mortenson@dot.ca.gov; rodney.tavitas@dot.ca.gov; Lucas.Sanchez@dot.ca.gov; Jelani.Young@dot.ca.gov; dick.fahey@dot.ca.gov; dick_fahey@dot.ca.gov

Cc: Harold Brazil <HBrazil@bayareametro.gov>; Ross McKeown <RMcKeown@bayareametro.gov>

Subject: RE: Urgent request for consultation on the Downtown Novato SMART station

I concur that this project is not regionally significant for air quality conformity purposes and that the inclusion of this project element in the 2019 TIP would not require an update to the Transportation Air Quality Conformity Analysis on the Amended Plan Bay Area 2040 and the 2019 TIP.

Thanks,
Ken

Ken Born
Planning and Air Quality Team Leader
Federal Highway Administration - California Division
650 Capitol Mall Ste. 4-100, Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: 916-498-5012
Email: kenneth.born@dot.gov

From: Kraft, Dominique

Sent: Thursday, July 19, 2018 1:15 PM

To: Andrea Gordon <AGordon@baaqmd.gov>; Adam Crenshaw <ACrenshaw@bayareametro.gov>;

OConnor.Karina@epa.gov; Vagenas.ginger@EPA.gov; marilee.mortenson@dot.ca.gov; rodney.tavitas@dot.ca.gov; Lucas.Sanchez@dot.ca.gov; Born, Kenneth (FHWA) <kenneth.born@dot.gov>; Jelani.Young@dot.ca.gov; dick.fahey@dot.ca.gov; dick_fahey@dot.ca.gov
Cc: Harold Brazil <HBrazil@bayareametro.gov>; Ross McKeown <RMcKeown@bayareametro.gov>
Subject: RE: Urgent request for consultation on the Downtown Novato SMART station

I agree with Andrea. I'm very surprised to hear that boardings are not expected to exceed 200 by 2025. This sounds like a very conservative estimate. I reached out to SMART separately and they confirmed these numbers. While I do not believe it is a project of air quality concern, I do see with Andrea's point on project significance.

Dominique M. Kraft

Federal Transit Administration, Region IX
90 Seventh Street, Suite 15-300
San Francisco, CA 94103-6701
Phone Number: 415-734-9469
Email: dominique.kraft@dot.gov

From: Andrea Gordon [<mailto:AGordon@baaqmd.gov>]
Sent: Wednesday, July 18, 2018 2:52 PM
To: Adam Crenshaw <ACrenshaw@bayareametro.gov>; OConnor.Karina@epa.gov; Vagenas.ginger@EPA.gov; Kraft, Dominique <Dominique.Kraft@dot.gov>; marilee.mortenson@dot.ca.gov; rodney.tavitas@dot.ca.gov; Lucas.Sanchez@dot.ca.gov; Born, Kenneth (FHWA) <kenneth.born@dot.gov>; Jelani.Young@dot.ca.gov; dick.fahey@dot.ca.gov; dick_fahey@dot.ca.gov
Cc: Harold Brazil <HBrazil@bayareametro.gov>; Ross McKeown <RMcKeown@bayareametro.gov>
Subject: RE: Urgent request for consultation on the Downtown Novato SMART station

Only 200 boarding's per day by 2025 given peak hour congestion on Highway 101? Downtown Novato station was projected to have the most utilization. Task Force may want to reassess project significance.

Thanks,
Andrea

From: Adam Crenshaw [<mailto:ACrenshaw@bayareametro.gov>]
Sent: Wednesday, July 18, 2018 12:34 PM
To: OConnor.Karina@epa.gov; Vagenas.ginger@EPA.gov; Andrea Gordon <AGordon@baaqmd.gov>; dominique.kraft@dot.gov; marilee.mortenson@dot.ca.gov; rodney.tavitas@dot.ca.gov; Lucas.Sanchez@dot.ca.gov; kenneth.born@dot.gov; Jelani.Young@dot.ca.gov; dick.fahey@dot.ca.gov; dick_fahey@dot.ca.gov
Cc: Harold Brazil <HBrazil@bayareametro.gov>; Ross McKeown <RMcKeown@bayareametro.gov>
Subject: Urgent request for consultation on the Downtown Novato SMART station

Importance: High

Good afternoon,

This email is to request the Air Quality Conformity Task Force's guidance on whether or not the addition of a new SMART station in Downtown Novato to the 2019 TIP would require a new conformity analysis on the Amended Plan Bay Area 2040 and the 2019 TIP. I apologize for the short notice, but since this issue may affect the public review period that is set to end **this Thursday, July 19**, we would appreciate a response as soon as possible.

Background:

The Draft 2019 TIP and the Draft Transportation Air Quality Conformity Analysis were released for public review on June 18, 2018. The review period is currently scheduled to end on July 19. The Draft 2019 TIP includes the Sonoma Marin Area Rail Corridor project (SON090002), which includes the initial operating segment (for informational purposes as all funds for this element are in prior years and this segment is open to the public) as well as committed extensions of the line. The transportation networks used for the conformity analysis also reflected the initial operating segment and the extensions. Neither the TIP project nor the transportation network used for the conformity analysis included the addition of an infill station in Downtown Novato.

During the review period for these documents, staff received a request to include this station in the 2019 TIP. Average daily boardings at the new Downtown Novato station is not expected to exceed 200 passengers by 2025. SMART is considering whether or not to implement skip stop service for the Novato stations, but, as of yet, MTC staff is not aware of a finalized operating plan. SMART is not currently planning to close either of the two existing Novato stations. Average daily boardings on the SMART system as a whole are expected be below 6,000 by 2025.

Air Quality Concerns:

The addition of a new train station is not considered exempt from regional conformity analysis per 40 CFR 93.126 or 40 CFR 93.127. However, given the low number of boardings expected at this station, we believe that the project does not qualify as regionally significant for air quality conformity purposes. For comparison, two projects classified as regionally significant, BART's extension to Warm Springs and BART to Antioch projects, are expected to generate 7,200 new transit trips per day by 2025 and 5,400 new transit trips per day by 2030, respectively.

We are requesting the Task Force's concurrence that the proposed addition of the Downtown Novato SMART station maybe deemed not regionally significant for air quality conformity purposes and that the inclusion of this project element in the 2019 TIP would not require an update to the Transportation Air Quality Conformity Analysis on the Amended Plan Bay Area 2040 and the 2019 TIP.

Thank you very much for your consideration. Please let me know if you have any questions.

Adam L. Crenshaw
Transportation Improvement Program Manager

acrenshaw@bayareametro.gov

BAY AREA METRO | BayAreaMetro.gov
Association of Bay Area Governments
Metropolitan Transportation Commission

Bay Area Metro Center | 375 Beale Street | Suite 800
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 778-6794

Please note my new email

b. MTC/SACOG Air Quality Planning/Conformity MOU

Harold Brazil (MTC) stated that the MTC/SACOG Air Quality Planning/Conformity MOU had been approved by MTC and was in the process of being executed by both MTC and SACOG. Ginger Vagenas (EPA) asked for the final version of the MOU and indicated the three Bay Area regional agencies (MTC, ABAG and BAAQMD) would submit the regionally approved SIP revision to EPA. Ms. Vagenas added that if there is any EPA input needed prior to submitting the revision, she will notify MTC, ABAG and BAAQMD.

c. Conformity Analysis for the 2019 Transportation Improvement Program and the Amended Plan Bay Area (End of public comment period)

Adam Crenshaw (MTC) mentioned that MTC received two comments in total on the 2019 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP), but neither comment involved the conformity analysis. Mr. Crenshaw added that MTC staff will be developing responses to the comments and the responses will be passed on to the Task Force.

Lucas Sanchez (Caltrans) reminded the Task Force (for clarification purposes) the ITS Improvements in San Mateo County Northern Cities project-level conformity determination letter will be provided by Caltrans.