Toll Increase Recommendation for the State-owned Bay Area Bridges

BATA Oversight Committee

December 9, 2009
## Public Hearings/Comments

### 4 Public Hearings:
- Oakland
- San Mateo
- Concord
- San Francisco

### Comments Received:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Comments Received</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public hearing comments</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Letters and E-mails</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Web survey responses</td>
<td>783</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,126</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Public Hearings/Comments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Tolls should not be increased, other funding should be found</td>
<td>AB 1175 makes the Antioch and Dumbarton seismic retrofits eligible for any remaining seismic retrofit program contingency funds; however, other state funding is not available.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Toll charges for carpools will reduce carpool use</td>
<td>Carpoolers will continue to have a significant time savings, especially in Bay Bridge corridor, which is the prime motivator.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Proposed toll increases for trucks are significant, especially since some trucking firms have fixed contracts</td>
<td>The proposed options begin to restore the auto/truck per axle toll differential that existed in 1992, when the per axle truck toll was three times the per axle auto toll.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Tolls should be increased to fund seismic retrofit of bridges and other needs, such as West Span bicycle lane on Bay Bridge</td>
<td>BATA only has authority to increase tolls for seismic retrofit of the bridges and other existing commitments. The $350 to $850 million estimate (2014 dollars) for the West Span bicycle path would require substantial new toll revenues.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Public Hearings/Comments

- **Web Survey:**
  - 783 responses:
    - 50% supported higher tolls for trucks
    - 63% opposed charging a toll for carpools
    - 60% supported congestion pricing on Bay Bridge
Major Reasons Driving the Need to Increase Revenues

- Dumbarton/Antioch Seismic Retrofit
- Increased Debt and Operations Costs
- Traffic Decreases
Funding Strategy

- Pursue operating cost savings
- Improve toll violation collections
- Seek new fund sources
- Increase tolls
Funding Strategy

- **Operating cost savings**
  - FY 2009-10 toll collection costs are estimated to be $2.5 million less than in FY 2008-09.

- **Improve toll violation collections**
  - Toll violations have decreased 25% from FY 2006-07.
  - In FY 2008-09, violation collections exceeded expected toll revenues from violations by $6.6 million.

- **Seek new fund sources**
  - AB 1175 adds Dumbarton & Antioch Bridges to Seismic Retrofit Program.
  - Current forecast of $40 million ending balance in SRP Program Contingency.
Option #1 — $5 for autos, $3 for carpools, & $6 per axle for trucks.

Option #2 — $5 for autos; $0 for carpools, & $10 per axle for trucks.

Option #3 — 6 Bridges: Same as Option #1; Bay Bridge: $6 for autos in peak and $4 for autos in non-peak (M-F), $5 for autos on weekends.
**Option - $7/4** — 6 Bridges: $5 for autos. Bay Bridge: $7 for autos in peak, $4 for autos in non-peak (M-F), $5 for autos on weekends. $2 for carpools & $6 per axle for trucks.

**Option - $7/5** — 6 Bridges: $5 for autos. Bay Bridge: $7 for autos in peak, $5 for autos in non-peak and weekends. $2 for carpools & $4 per axle for trucks.
Increased peak toll does not result in significant added delay reduction.

$7 peak toll options appear more related to revenue generation than congestion relief.
Toll Increase Recommendation

- **2-Axle Autos:**
  - 6 Bridges: $5.00 (Base Toll)
  - Bay Bridge Congestion Pricing: $6 peak; $4.00 non-peak; $5 weekends
  - Toll increase effective July 1, 2010

- **Carpools:**
  - 50% of 2-axle base toll ($5.00) rate, resulting in $2.50 toll charge for carpools.
  - Toll increase effective July 1, 2010

- **Trucks (multi-axle vehicles):**
  - 2-axle base toll ($5.00) rate × number of axles
  - One year grace period for truck toll increase (toll increase effective July 1, 2011)
- **Proposed Toll Increase**
  - **6 Bridges:** $5 for autos.
  - **Bay Bridge:** $6 for autos in peak, $4 for autos in non-peak (M-F) and $5 for autos on weekends.
  - **Carpools:** $2.50
  - **Trucks:** 2-axle base toll ($5.00) X number of axles
# Toll Increase Recommendation

## Proposed Toll Rates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vehicle Class</th>
<th>Current Toll</th>
<th>Option #1</th>
<th>Option #2</th>
<th>Option #3</th>
<th>Proposed Toll Increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2-Axle</td>
<td>$4.00</td>
<td>$5.00</td>
<td>$5.00</td>
<td>6 Bridges: $5.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bay Bridge: $6 peak, $4 non-peak, $5 weekends</td>
<td>6 Bridges: $5.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bay Bridge: $6 peak, $4 non-peak, $5 weekends</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-Axle</td>
<td>$6.00</td>
<td>$11.00</td>
<td>$15.00</td>
<td>$11.00</td>
<td>$15.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-Axle</td>
<td>$8.25</td>
<td>$17.00</td>
<td>$25.00</td>
<td>$17.00</td>
<td>$20.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-Axle</td>
<td>$11.25</td>
<td>$23.00</td>
<td>$35.00</td>
<td>$23.00</td>
<td>$25.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-Axle</td>
<td>$12.00</td>
<td>$29.00</td>
<td>$45.00</td>
<td>$29.00</td>
<td>$30.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7+-Axle</td>
<td>$13.50</td>
<td>$35.00</td>
<td>$55.00</td>
<td>$35.00</td>
<td>$35.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carpool</td>
<td>$0.00</td>
<td>$3.00</td>
<td>$0.00</td>
<td>$3.00</td>
<td>$2.50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Toll Increase Recommendation
Carpools

- **Requirements/Parameters**
  - All carpools would need to have a FasTrak account and toll tag.
  - Eligible vehicles charged at reduced rate:
    - Autos meeting occupancy requirements
    - Motorcycles and Hybrid vehicles
  - Public transit vehicles and commute buses would continue to be provided toll free passage.
  - Carpool hours on bridges would be maintained at current hours.

- **Infrastructure**
  - Toll equipment would need to be added to Dumbarton and Bay Bridge carpool lanes.
  - Carpool signage would be modified for all bridges.

- **Evaluation**
  - Annual report on carpool rates and impacts provided to BATA Oversight Committee
## Carpools: Carpool Use on State-owned Bridges

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bridge</th>
<th>Occupancy Requirement</th>
<th>Average Daily Carpoons</th>
<th>Percent of Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Antioch</td>
<td>3+</td>
<td>390</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benicia</td>
<td>3+</td>
<td>2,266</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carquinez</td>
<td>3+</td>
<td>4,652</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dumbarton</td>
<td>2+</td>
<td>5,321</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richmond</td>
<td>3+</td>
<td>1,785</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bay Bridge</td>
<td>3+</td>
<td>17,938</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Mateo</td>
<td>2+</td>
<td>6,117</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>38,429</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Bay Bridge accounts for almost half of total carpools on the bridges.

**BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY**
Toll Increase Recommendation
Trucks

- Requirements/Parameters
  - Proposed truck toll rates would be for all bridges at all hours.
  - Truck toll increase implementation would be delayed until July 1, 2011, which would reduce total new revenues by about $40 million for one year.

- Infrastructure
  - Toll rate signage would be modified at all bridges.
Proposed per axle truck toll is double the per axle toll for 2-axle autos, compared to about triple in 1992.
Toll Increase Recommendation
Bay Bridge Congestion Pricing

Requirements/Parameters
- Peak hours would be from 5 a.m. to 10 a.m. and from 3 p.m. to 7 p.m. (same as current carpool hours).
- Congestion pricing would only be applied to 2-axle vehicles.

Infrastructure
- CMS signs installed over all toll lanes to display time-of-day toll charge.
- Signage would be modified to inform motorists of congestion pricing.
- Toll collection system (ATCAS) testing and monitoring.

Evaluation
- Annual evaluation reports to be provided to BATA Oversight:
  - Traffic
    - Travel time savings
    - Mode shift
    - Impacts on non-peak travel
    - Impacts on other facilities and transit services
  - Motorist Feedback
    - Public awareness, acceptance and affordability
  - Operations
**Toll Increase Recommendation**

**Summary**

- Limits toll increase for 2-axle autos (90% of bridge traffic) to $1.00.

- Formula based carpool and truck tolls will automatically adjust whenever 2-axle rates are raised.

- The proposed toll for carpools is lower than in Options #1 and #3, which may mitigate potential impacts on carpool formation.

- A one year grace period for trucks will allow trucking firms to adjust or to mitigate impacts of existing contracts.

- Bay Bridge congestion pricing at $6 peak and $4 off-peak produces an expected 23 percent delay reduction.
# Implementation Schedule

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Meeting</th>
<th>Discussion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>December 9, 2009</td>
<td>BATA Oversight Committee</td>
<td><strong>Staff recommendation on toll option</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 13, 2010</td>
<td>BATA Oversight Committee</td>
<td><strong>Committee action on toll increase</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 27, 2010</td>
<td>BATA</td>
<td><strong>Authority action on toll increase</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July 1, 2010</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Toll increase is effective for 2-axle autos and carpools</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July 1, 2011</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Toll increase is effective for trucks (multi-axle vehicles)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Comments may be sent to BATA by:

Fax — 510.817.5848
E-mail — tolls@mtc.ca.gov

http://bata.mtc.ca.gov